

THE STUDY ON THE CORONAVIRUS PANDEMIC USING HUMAN RIGHTS AND HUMAN SECURITY APPROACH

by Indah Pangestu Amaritasari

Submission date: 28-Feb-2023 04:10AM (UTC-0500)

Submission ID: 2025147302

File name: 2479-10869-2-PB.pdf (410.02K)

Word count: 11540

Character count: 66213

THE STUDY ON THE CORONAVIRUS PANDEMIC USING HUMAN RIGHTS AND HUMAN SECURITY APPROACH

Indah Pangestu Amaritasari
Pusat Studi Keamanan Nasional
Universitas Bhayangkara Jakarta Raya
Indah.pangestu@dsn.ubharajaya.ac.id

ABSTRACT

In March 2020, The World Health Organization (WHO) finally announced a coronavirus or Covid-19 disease outbreak as a pandemic. According to WHO, the status of a pandemic is determined if a new disease has not had an antidote against the spread of the virus in regions of the world. The virus attacked individuals and no doubt the impact on people is significant, which relates to the security of the people and human rights aspects. The article explores the argumentative basis of human security and further analyzes the problem, strategy and needs in the lens of human rights related to pandemic in the framework of human security. It aims to analytically describe human security approaches in relation to the COVID-19 with human rights perspective through the common pattern of threat identified worldwide and plausible strategies based on literature study. The state strategy addressed in the article exists as a set of examples of best practices and/or critics toward the policy with materials provided by journals. The article uses a qualitative approach with a systematic literature study based on human security framework with human-right analysis and results in a generic set of human security frameworks for COVID-19 with the perspective of human rights.

Keywords: pandemic; corona virus; covid-19; human security; human rights.

INTRODUCTION

Approximately, two months after Coronavirus outbreak in Wuhan, World Health Organisation (WHO) declared the outbreak as a pandemic. The COVID-19 speedily spread out across the globe within less than six months. The pandemic has made severe problems including socioeconomic disruption,¹ postponement or cancelation of sporting, religious, and cultural event the widespread of fears of supply shortages resulting in panic buying,² misinformation about

the virus,³ and some incidents of xenophobia and discrimination against Chinese people and East Asia including Southeast Asia.⁴ The pandemic is a threat to human security.⁵ It poses as a new threat to international peace and security.⁶ As a threat

- 1 The New York Times Editorial, "Here Comes the Coronavirus Pandemic: Now, After Many Drills, the World May Be Facing a Real Fire," *The New York Times*, February 29, 2020, <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/02/29/opinion/sunday/corona-virus-usa.html>.
- 2 Jade Scipioni, "Why There Will Soon Be Tons of Toilet Paper, and What Food Be Scarce, According to Supply Chain Experts," *CNBC*, April 9, 2020, <https://www.cnbc.com/2020/03/18/supply-chain-experts-foods-that-could-be-less-available-in-pandemic.html>.

- 3 Rachel Clamp, "Coronavirus and the Black Death: Spread of Misinformation and Xenophobia Shows We Haven't Learned from Our Past," *The Conversation*, March 5, 2020, <https://theconversation.com/coronavirus-and-the-black-death-spread-of-misinformation-and-xenophobia-shows-we-havent-learned-from-our-past-132802>.
- 4 Sabrina Tavernise and Richard A. Ooppel J., "Spit on, Yelled at, Attacked: Chinese-American of Their Safety," *New York Times*, March 23, 2020, <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/03/23/us/chinese-coronavirus-racist-attacks.html>.
- 5 Robert Glasser, "The Pandemic Threat to Human Security," *Huffpost*, last modified 2016, accessed May 5, 2020, https://www.huffpost.com/entry/the-pandemic-threat-to-hu_b_9252494.
- 6 Ilja Richard Pavone, "Infectious Diseases as a New Threat to International Peace and Security: The Security Council and the Securitization of Health," *Völkerrechtsblog*.

that severely affected human, this article mainly focus on the human security and human rights by exploring the answer to the question on how the threat should be responded accordance to human security framework and human rights perspective.

Human rights and human security are interlinked on which the existence of human rights is to protect the human security, particularly described under article 6 of ICCPR (International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights).⁷ As an approach to security, the human security has started bigger after the cold war. It is necessary to use this approach by looking into its advantages of having this approach to respond to pandemic threat. According to the Commission on Human Security (CHR) at the United Nations, there are two sets of reasons using human security as an approach to security.

First, human security is needed in response to complexity and the interrelatedness of both old and new security threats - chronic and persistent poverty to ethnic violence, human trafficking, climate change, health pandemics, international terrorism, and sudden economic and financial downturns. Such threats tend to acquire transnational dimensions and move beyond traditional notions of security that focus on external military aggressions alone.

Second, human security is required as a comprehensive approach that utilizes the wide range of new opportunities to tackle such threats in an integrated manner. Human security threats cannot be tackled through conventional mechanisms alone. Instead, they require a new consensus that acknowledges the linkages and the interdependencies between development, human rights and national security.⁷

The UN Commission of Human Security's report in *Human Security Now* defines human

security as follows,⁸

... to protect the vital core of all human lives in ways that enhance human freedoms and human fulfillment. Human security means protecting fundamental freedoms - freedoms that are the essence of life. It means protecting people from critical (severe) and pervasive (widespread) threats and situations. It means using processes that build on people's strengths and aspirations. It means creating political, social, environmental, economic, military and cultural systems that together give people the building blocks of survival, livelihood and dignity.

The traditional model unable to respond to the challenge of the Covid-19 because the disease reveals the underlying social, ethnic, and gender inequality on which it cannot be regarded as public health challenge merely.⁹ Of course the concept has some weaknesses, as any other ideas, but the human security should go beyond theory and imperfectness into "a normative compass in favour of the everyday experiences of insecurity and deprivation".¹⁰ It is further undelined by other research in Indonesia on which Covid-19 is threaten human life, well-being, and human dignity where many social problem, like stigma, entail¹¹.

The coronavirus pandemic has brought government of all nations to shift the national security into human security.¹² This article aims

7 United Nations (UN). *Human Security in Theory and Practice*. New York: United Nations: 6. United Nations Development Program (UNDP), *Human Development Report 1994. New Dimensions of Human Security* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1994): 3.

8 United Nations Development Program (UNDP), "New Dimensions of Human Security," in *Human Development Report 1994* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1994): 3.

9 Edward Newman. "Covid-19: A Human Security Analysis." *Global Society*, 29 (12). (2021):1-24.

10 Ibid: 16.

11 Hastoro Dwinantoaji, and Sumami, D. W. "Human security, social stigma, and global health: the COVID-19 pandemic in Indonesia." *Journal of the Medical Sciences (Berkala Ilmu Kedokteran)*, 52(3). (2020): 158-165. <https://doi.org/10.19106/JMedSciI005203202014>

12 Granoff, Johnathan & Kellman, Barry. "The National Security is too crude to protect us from pandemic. It's time to shift to human security instead." *Newsweek*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.newsweek.com/human-security-national-security-covid-19-coronavirus-1492830>

to analyze the COVID-19 problems in relation to human, which further can be used to develop a strategy by the state to respond to the pandemic.

METHOD

The study uses the qualitative method with descriptive and cluster analysis. Qualitative method encourages understanding of the substance of an event. Thus, qualitative research is not only to fulfill the researcher's desire to get an overview/explanation, but also help to get a deeper explanation.¹³ This is a preliminary desk research to see the correlation of the coronavirus pandemic with the human security life. The data obtained from secondary resources that are accessible to public. Its reliability was considered through triangulation method by comparing between one information to the others using the credible website. The data used in this article is from journal, book, report, videos, news related to human security and pandemic. It is further analyzed using human rights perspective through the framework of human security theory and described narratively as how the framework compared to the impact caused by the Covid-19 pandemic.

Human rights perspectives are reflected to the analysis of the human security, especially taking into account the human security principle on all-people, which associated with non-discrimination and equality. People with different ability need to be taken into account.

The data gathered and clustered using UN human security approach. It is categorized into seven factors of human security identified under the multi-sectoral aspect (Table 1).

Table 1
Type of Human Security

Type of Security	Definition	Threat
Economic Security	An assured basic income	Poverty, unemployment, indebtedness, lack of income
Food Security	Physical and economic access to basic food	Hungers, Famines, and the lack of physical and economic access to basic food
Health Security	Protection from disease and unhealthy life styles	Inadequate healthcare, new and recurrent diseases including epidemics, and pandemics, poor nutrition, and unsafe lifestyles
Environmental Security	Healthy physical environment	Environmental degradations, natural disasters, pollutions, and resource depletions
Personal Security	Security from physical environment	From the state (torture), other states (wars), group of people (ethnic tension), individuals or gangs (crime), industrial, workplace, or traffic accidents
Community Security	Safe membership in the group	From the group (oppressive practices), between groups (ethnic violence), from dominant groups (e.g indigenous people vulnerability)
Political Security	Living in society that honors basic human rights	Political or state repression, including torture, disappearance, human rights violations, detentions and imprisonments

Source from Kaji Ulang Indeks Keamanan Manusia, drafted by Edy Prasetyono Ph.D., Riefqi Muna Ph.D., Mahmud Syaltout Ph.D supported by Bappenas and UNDP.

The current COVID-19 event is analyzed by making connection to the framework established in order to develop a framework of the COVID-19 threat and capacity needs under human security framework. For the purpose to sharpen the study,

76

13 Shoshanna Sofaer. "Qualitative Methods: What Are They And Why Use Them?." *Health Services Research*. Dec; 34(5 Pt 2). (1999): 1101-1111.

78

the limited quantitative method is used through data analyzing and real-life case situation of particular countries.

DISCUSSION

A. Human Security as A Security Approach

The posture of the current security approach is changing compared to cold war. State can no longer become the only threat. The concept of threat is transformed into different formats where can be borderless and without any relation with military activity. It is understood as the non-traditional security or contemporary security.¹⁴ The significant contribution to the non-traditional security is coming from Buzzan and Copenhagen Schools who widening the concept of security as describes below:¹⁵

Security is taken to be about the pursuit of freedom from threat and the ability of states and societies to maintain their independent identity and their functional integrity against forces of change, which they see as hostile. The bottom line of security is survival, but it is also reasonably includes a substantial range of concerns about the conditions of existence.

Individual security is related to the need and rights that can result on the safety and security of community and individual and the human security factors. A study on conjugal visit for inmates indicates that the management of the visit through the family programme helped to lessen the sexual violence.¹⁶ Even though this issue is important, but it also needs to be taken into account preciously, as the case of Uzbekistan, the arrangement of such visit was actually nurturing the prostitution.¹⁷

The militaristic approach to the security which was familiar during cold war is shifting into the human security, societal security, environmental security, and economic security. Thus, the terminology of security has a broad understanding and vary that leads to the consideration of having another word follows after security. Based ⁸⁴ that, the security can be categorized into (1) international Security and Global Security for the World ⁸⁴ level, (2) National (State) Security for state level, (3) Public Security and Order for societal level, and (4) Human Security level for individual level. There is also another category of security that is viewed based on the area national, regional, international, and global.¹⁸

It was stated the human security was actually born long before cold war. As an idea, it was started since the establishment of International Red Cross in 1896.¹⁹ The idea is further approved in "UN Charter" in 1945 and "Universal Declaration of Human Rights" in 1948. The intellectual origin was started in 1970s, but it was not rapidly developed because of the dominant approach on security namely traditional security approach due to cold war.²⁰

³⁹ In the field of international relations, the concept of human security is highly debated between two main thoughts: UNDP perspective and Canadian School. The UNDP identifies in its report on *The New Dimensions of Human Security* that human security has two main aspect.³⁵ The first aspect, human security is understood as safety from chronic threats such as hunger, disease, and recession. The second aspect, human security is a protection from sudden and hurtful disruption in the patterns of daily life-whether in home, jobs, or communities.²¹ This approach is known as a human

¹³
14 Indah Amarisari. "Keamanan Nasional dalam Konteks Isu-isu Global Kontemporer: Sebuah injauan Hubungan Internasional". *Jurnal Keamanan Nasional*, Vol 3 No. 1. (2019):109.
15 Barry Buzzan, Ole Wæver and Jaap deWilde, *Security: A new Framework for Analysis*. (London::Lynne-Rienner Publishers, 1998): 21.
16 Budi Utami, N, and Mellynda, O. "Conjugal Visit: Juridical Review of the Fulfilment of Inmates' Rights in the Correctional Perspective." *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 16(1). (2022): 97-118.
17 Ibid: 98.

²⁹
18 John Baylis. *The Globalisation of World Politics: An Introduction to International Relations Third Edition*. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008).
19 Commission on Human Security. *Human Security Now: Final Report*, (New York: CHS, 2003).
20 Bosold, David and Sascha Werthes. *Human Security in Practice: Canadian and Japanese Experiences*. (International Politics and Society, 2005): 86.
21 United Nations Development Program (UNDP),

security approach on 'freedom from want'.²² The UNDP argues that this approach cannot be realised by prioritising different issues, but has to be in the framework that takes into account the impact of seven factors (physical security, political security, community security, food security, health security, environmental security, and economic security), which affect person.²³

Another approach to human security is related to what has been applied by states, one of them is Canada. The Canadian government, in its foreign policy, described its focus on human security in relation to the civilian protection from violent conflicts.²⁴ The Canadian perspective argued that human security was security against economic privatization, an acceptable quality of life, and guarantee of fundamental human rights. This perspective identified as a human security approach on 'freedom from fear'.²⁵

The two approaches of human security have opposite in character. One can argue, like David Bosold and Sacha Werthes, that the argument and/or the divergent shows how difficult to implement the concept at the policy level.²⁶ The Canadian government use the protection approach of human security, which is related to top-down intervention. On the other hand, UNDP used the empowerment perspective to the human security approach that closely associated with bottom-up characteristic, but this actually happens because two approaches are different security category and threat. The freedom from fear is used by the state under the state category framework by referring to its national standards, whereas the UNDP's freedom from want is operated under the category of individual security in the framework of international cooperation among civilized states.

The selection of the approach is based on the threat addressed. Canada used the human security approach for its foreign policy in 1996. Padelford and Lincoln argued that "A State's Foreign Policy is totality of its dealings with the external environment. Foreign Policy is the overall result of the process by which a state translates its broadly conceived goals and interests into specific courses of action in order to achieve its objectives and preserve its interests".²⁷ Two functions of foreign policy can be extracted from Padelford and Lincoln's definition; first, foreign policy is to attain its conceived goals and second, to pressurize its national interests.²⁸ The UNDP's human security perspective is looking into internal threat which is described as localised threat. It can be specific between states and local government. It is varied between states and local government because of their different situation of the seven factors of UNDP human security framework.²⁹ Both approaches have also different referent object. The UNDP's approach has a referent object of individual person in a state or local government. On the other hand, the Canadian perspective of foreign policy saw the referent object of individual outside the country.

In solving the debate, finally the Human Security Unit at the UN issued a framework to operationalize the human security concept, which accommodates protection side (the Canadian perspective) and empowerment aspect (the UNDP's paradigm). While the human security focuses on all people, the human rights-based approach as perspective to have attention to most marginalized, excluded or discriminated against. This often requires an analysis of gender norms, different forms of discrimination and power imbalances to ensure that interventions reach the most marginalized segments of the population. In relation to the impact of COVID-19, the

¹⁰⁴ *Human Development Report 1994. New Dimensions of Human Security*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1994: 3.

¹⁰⁹ Bosold, David & Werthes, Sascha. Op.Cit.

²³ Ibid: 87.

²⁴ Ibid: 87.

²⁵ Ibid: 86.

²⁶ Ibid: 87.

²⁷ Bojang, AS. "The Study of Foreign Policy in International Relations." *J Pol Sci Pub Aff* 6 (2018): 2.

²⁸ Ibid: 3.

²⁹ Ibid: 4.

orientation is focused on the most at risk of being left behind.³⁰

B. Human Security to Pandemic: Identifying Threats

Human Rights is certainly under threat in the pandemic situation, especially on the issue related to emergency constitutional law.³¹ The threat posed under the framework of human security analysis is driven from the seven category that UNDP describes as seven factors. Table 2 below shows how the threat reflects under the framework.

Table 2.
Type of Threat related to Human Security Based on Human Security Framework

No	Type of Security	Examples of Main Threat
1	Economic Security	Persistent of poverty, Unemployment, gender inequality in labor market
2	Food Security	Hunger, famine.
3	Health Security	Deadly infectious disease, mental health, unsafe food, malnutrition, lack of access to basic health care.
4	Environmental Security	Environmental degradation, resource depletion, natural disaster, pollution.
5	Personal Security	Physical violence, crime, terrorism, domestic violence, child labor.
6	Community Security	Inter-ethnic, religious and other identity-based tension
7	Political Security	Political repression, human rights abuse.

Source: Human Security Unit of United Nations from the book on Human Security Theory and Practice.

Basically, any issues related to human security is analyzed within the framework. In relation to COVID-19, the framework is further analyzed with the cause effect to particular type of security that commonly emerges in most countries. Corona virus, identified as SARS-CoV-2 (also

associated as HcoV-19), is the seventh coronavirus infected human.³² The pandemic is the direct threat to health particularly on the issue on Critical National Infrastructure.³³ The pandemic mostly hit the people. Clark describes below.

When a pandemic strikes, the biggest initial impact will be on people. Employees will be taken ill and some may well succumb to the contagion which in turn could have the effect of traumatising fellow workers. There will be those who are too scared to come to work and with an almost inevitable public transport disruption, there will be those who have no means of getting to work. Some may have to look after children, if schools are forced to close, or they may become carers for sick family members. Others could be forcibly quarantined because they have been exposed to the disease.³⁴

The similar affect made to COVID-19. Any related policy can certainly make impact to people particularly the vulnerable one. For this COVID-19, the economic impact hit those with limited income and self-employed or working in informal environment in gig economy or in part-time work in zero-hour contracts.³⁵ Indonesia unemployment rate increases from 5.7 to 7.5 due to COVID-19³⁶ because of the pandemic, similar to USA.³⁷ Besides economic problem in relation to

30 European Network for National Human Rights Institution. ⁷³ *human rights-based approach to COVID-19 economic response and recovery - protecting jobs, SMEs and workers, including in the context of national recovery and resilience plans.* ²⁰ *gium*: ENNHRI, 2022.

31 Rizki Bagus Prasetyo. "Pandemi Covid-19: Perspektif Hukum Tata Negara Darurat dan Perlindungan HAM." *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 15(2). (2021): 327-346.

32 Kristian G. Andersen, Rambaut, Andrew; Lipkin, ⁴⁴ Holmes, C. Edward; Garry, F. Robert. (2020). "The proximal origin of SARS-CoV-2." *Nature Medicine*, 26 (4). (2020): 450-252.

33 ⁴⁷ k, Robert. "Critical National Infrastructures." *Business Continuity and the Pandemic Threat.* (United Kingdom: IT Governance Publishing, 2016): 115-123.

34 *Ibid*: 141-196.

35 John Scott. "This is The Human Impact Of Covid-19-And How Business Can Help." *World Forum Economic.* Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. *The Jakarta Post*. <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2020/03/this-is-the-human-impact-of-covid-19-and-how-business-can-help/>

36 Prima Wirayani. "As COVID-19 bites, Current Labor Rules Can Protect Jobs." *Th⁹⁰ karta Post*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.thejakartapost.com/academia/2020/04/30/as-covid-19-bites-current-labor-rules-can-protect-jobs.html>

37 Nigel Chiwaya. "The coronavirus has destroyed the job market in very states." *NBC News*. Last modified 2021. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.nbcnews>.

COVID-19, the personal security also arises.

The human cost is merged from the deaths of friends and family to the physical effects of infection and the mental trauma and fear.³⁸ Panic and feel being denied life-saving protection or treatment may lead to panic buying.³⁹ The symptoms of traumatic stress, confusion, and anger, all of which are exacerbated by fear of infection, having limited access to supplies of necessities, inadequate information or experience of economic loss or stigma are unavoidable.⁴⁰ Most countries' policy is locking down and/or staying at home to prevent the spread of virus. The policy increased a level of stress, if it analyses using the hierarchy of human needs. In level one, the immediate psychological need creates hunger, thirst, sex, elimination, and sleep, which can be an issue of 'panic buying'.⁴¹ In the level two of the human need, the need of social protection indicated that the lockdown policy met self-protection need became 'normal' and individuals experience frustration systematically in order to ensure self and family protection.⁴² If the individuals consume alcohol and drugs to overcome their fears, aggressive behavior can turn into violent behavior to family especially to women and children.⁴³ In the end, it increases the numbers of homicides and suicides.⁴⁴

Based on the data gathered by WHO, there was a 25% massive increased of global rates of anxiety

- ² [com/business/economy/unemployment-claims-state-see-how-covid-19-has-destroyed-job-n1183686](https://www.bbc.com/business/economy/unemployment-claims-state-see-how-covid-19-has-destroyed-job-n1183686)
- 38 Scott, Op. Cit.
- 39 Ibid.
- 40 Ibid.
- 41 Thiago Matias., Dominski, Fabio H., and David F Marks. "Human needs in COVID-19 isolation." *Journal of Health Psychology*, 24 (6). (2020): 833-843.
- 42 Ibid: 835.
- 43 Amber Peterman, Alina Pots, Megans O'neil, et al. "Pandemics and violence against women and children." *Center for Global Development Working Paper 528*. last modified 2021, accessed May 5, 2020. <http://iawmh.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/04/pandemics-and-vawg-april2.pdf>
- 44 Andrew M Campbell. "An increasing risk of family violence during the Covid-19 pandemic: Strengthening community collaborations to save lives." *Forensic Science International: Reports* Vol 2, December. (2020): 1-3.

¹¹⁴ in the first year of the COVID-19 pandemic.⁴⁵ It was identified that the worst deterioration occurred in the areas worst-hit by COVID-19 -where infections were high and social interaction was restricted.⁴⁶ In Japan, for the first time, the rate of women suicide reach to the highest because of economic impact caused by Pandemic.⁴⁷ Only in October 2020 alone, 879 women ended their lives, almost a double than previous year.⁴⁸ The case of Nazuna Hashimoto, a suicide-attempt survivor, she got panic attacks when the pandemic started and began to feel unstable.⁴⁹ When the society engulfed with panic of the Pandemic, she began her first attempt, but they are unsuccessful. Not quite long after the attempt, some people in her apartment's neighborhood made a similar effort.

According to WHO study on the pandemic's impact, several key findings are relevant in relation to mental health aspect related to Pandemic:⁵⁰

- (1) There was a significant increase in mental health problems in the general population in the first year of the pandemic.
- (2) Though data are mixed, younger age, female gender and pre-existing health conditions were often reported risk factors.
- (3) Further research on mental health and COVID-19 among specific at-risk populations and in Many low- and middle-income countries (LMICs) is needed.

45 United Nations Trust Fund for Human Security. "COVID-19: Depression, anxiety soared 25 per cent in a year." *News UN*. Last modified 2022. Accessed June 17, 2022. <https://news.un.org/en/story/2022/03/1113162>

46 Ibid.

47 BBC News. "Japan's suicide rate rises during Pandemic." *YouTube*. Uploaded by BBC News 8 February 2021. Last modified 2020. Last modified 2021. Accessed June 17, 2022. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=avirbVbeVEk>

48 VICE News. "Japan Is Facing an Alarming Spike in Female Suicides." *YouTube*. Uploaded by VICE News 1 July 2021. Last modified 2020. Last modified 2021. Accessed June 17, 2022. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6kK9dpazrMY>

49 Ibid.

50 World Health Organization. "Scientific Brief: Mental Health and COVID-19: Early evidence of the pandemic's impact." *WHO* Last modified 2020. Last modified 2022. Accessed June 17, 2022. https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/WHO-2019-nCoV-Sci-Brief-Mental_health-2022.1

- (4) Exhaustion (in healthcare workers), loneliness and positive COVID-19 diagnosis increased risk for suicidal thoughts.²⁴
- (5) Reports indicated that disruptions were in-part mitigated by shifting services towards e-mental health care.
- (6) Inadequate infrastructure, pre-existing inequalities and low levels of technological literacy were reported e-health barriers.
- (7) Many evidence-based psychological interventions for mental disorders were available before the COVID-19 pandemic.⁹³
- (8) Psychological interventions studied were effective at preventing or reducing pandemic-related mental health problems, though data is limited.

Social inequalities merged to be one of the impacts of pandemic. Many studies have conducted research whether the changes in time use due to lockdown measures are the same for women and men. Between March and May 2020 (UK 1st lockdown), British men were found to be more likely to be furloughed or dismissed from work than women.⁵¹ In the UK, BAME (Black, Asian, and Minority) immigrants are more likely to experience economic hardship right after the first lockdown.⁵² People with low education and low income suffer substantially during the pandemic. They greatly increase likelihood of losing their job and income in countries such as Canada⁵³, United Kingdom,⁵⁴ and the United States⁵⁵. Many of those with low education are

- 51 Dirk Witteveen. "Sociodemographic inequality in exposure to COVID-19-induced economic hardship in the United Kingdom", *Research in Social Stratification and Mobility*, Volume 69. (2020): 1-10
- 52 Yang Hu. "Intersecting ethnic and migrant inequalities in the economic impact of the COVID-19 pandemic in the UK", *Research in Social Stratification and Mobility*, Volume 68. (2020): 1-6.
- 53 Thomas Lemieux, Kevin Milligan, Tammy Schirle, Mikal Skuterud, "Initial impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic on the Canadian labour market". *University of Toronto Journal*, Volume 46 Issue S1. (2020): S66-S81
- 54 Witteveen, Dirk. Op. Cit. 4.
- 55 Brea L Perry et al. Perry BL, Aronson B, Pescosolido BA. "Pandemic precarity: COVID-19 is exposing and exacerbating inequalities in the American heartland". *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A*. 2(23). (2021): 1-10.

trapped in low-skilled jobs with tight financial constraints. As a result, the underprivileged group reported a high degree of difficulty during the UK's first lockdown.⁵⁶

Feeling rejected and discriminated occurred to those who get the disease and whose his/her family died because of COVID-19. In Iraq, a man waited for one week for the burial of his elderly father after COVID-19 because every cemetery in his province refused to accept his body.⁵⁷ The same case happened in Indonesia and in Italy. East Java Governor of Republic of Indonesia, Khofifah Indar Parawansa, has also tried hard, to remind people that their refusal to allow the burial of the dead goes against the teachings of every religion.⁵⁸ This can also be related to data. It can support the targeted population, but also has to be treated carefully because it can accidentally increase stigma for affected populations.⁵⁹ This will certainly impact their economic situation and may negatively impact access to care and ability to pay for care.⁶⁰

In relation to personal security in China, Jianli County, which is administered by Jingzhou, had received 162 reports of domestic violence in February — three times more than the 47 reported during the same month the previous year. The number of cases reported in January had also

- 56 Daniel Chen T.-H., and Yi-Jen Wang. "Inequality-Related Health and Social Factors and Their Impact on Well-Being during the COVID-19 Pandemic: Findings from a National Survey in the UK" *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*. Vol 18, no. 3. (2021) 6014.
- 57 Ammar Karim. "In Iraq, no resting place for coronavirus dead." *The Jakarta Post*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 6 2020. <https://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2020/03/30/in-iraq-no-resting-place-for-coronavirus-dead.html>
- 58 Komelis Purba. "When your dead body is rejected everywhere." Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. *The Jakarta Post*. <https://www.thejakartapost.com/academia/2020/04/08/when-your-dead-body-is-rejected-everywhere.html>
- 59 Debra Pett Burns, Nina Vanessa Kraguljac, Thomas R Bruns. "COVID-19: Facts, Cultural Considerations, and Risk of Stigmatization." *Journal of Transcultural Nursing*. 31(4). (2020): 326-332.
- 60 Ibid: 328.

doubled compared with the same period last year.⁶¹ In Milan, the family of a coronavirus victim had to keep the corpse for 36 hours because ambulances refused to carry the body. This has happened in other places hit hardest by the virus.⁶² Crime is also increased in Mexico and Indonesia. In March, the homicide reached to highest figure since 1997, which is registered 2,585 homicides.⁶³ In capital city of Indonesia, Jakarta, crime increased up to 10% during COVID-10.⁶⁴

Regarding environmental security, animal is being abandoned and forest can be at risk. Due to lock down policy and/or social distancing, the team of forest protection cannot get out to do their job.⁶⁵ Furthermore, animals are abandoned with hunger and starving or being killed start of the outbreak.⁶⁶ The animals can also be infected with the virus.⁶⁷

Human rights violations as well as political repression during COVID-19 can be heightened.

- 61 Zhang Wanqing. "Domestic violence cases surge during COVID-19 epidemic." *Sixth Tone*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.sixthtone.com/news/1005253/domestic-violence-cases-surge-during-covid-19-epidemic>
- 62 melis Purba, Op. Cit.
- 63 David Agren. "Mexico murder rate reaches new high as violence rage amid Covid-19 spread". *The Guardian*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2020/apr/03/mexico-murder-rate-homicide-coronavirus-covid-19>
- 64 Kompas. "Angka kriminalitas Jakarta meningkat 10% selama Pandemi Covid-19." *Kompas*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://ogapolitan.kompas.com/read/2020/04/27/15420281/angka-kriminalitas-di-jakarta-meningkat-10-persen-selama-pandemi-covid-19>
- 65 Michael Taylor. "Deforestation risk rise as the coronavirus hindered the SE protection." *Reuters*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.reuters.com/article/health-coronavirus-deforestation/deforestation-risks-rise-as-coronavirus-hinders-se-asia-protection-idUSL8N2BJ12Z>
- 66 Allen Kim. "Cats and dogs abandoned at the start of the coronavirus outbreak are now starving or being killed." *CNN*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://edition.cnn.com/2020/03/15/asia/coronavirus-animals-pets-trnd/index.html>
- 67 Natasha Daly. "Tiger tests positive for coronavirus at Bronx Zoo, first known case in the world." *National Geographic*. Last modified 2021. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.nationalgeographic.com/animals/2020/04/tiger-coronavirus-covid19-positive-test-bronx-zoo/>

According to the freedom tracker developed by International Center for Not-For-Profit Law (ICNL),⁶⁸ there are 30 countries with measure that affect expression, 111 countries affect assembly, and 27 countries affect privacy.⁶⁹ Inadequate hospital happened in part of world such as United States of America, Serbia, Latin America. Journalist Ana Laic was arrested because of her report on inadequate hospital facilities for Coronavirus.⁷⁰ In Indonesia, expression made from victims is essential, such as Aksi Kamisan, for voicing justice,⁷¹ despite of the pandemic situation.

Based on the description on the Coronavirus impact to people, the type of threat caused by covid-19 pandemic can be described in the table below.

Table 3.
Type of Covid-19/Pandemic Threat under Human Security Framework

103	Type of Security	Main Threat
1	Economic Security	Unemployment
2	Food Security	Limited supplies and necessities
103	Health Security	Lack of Health Infrastructure
3	Environmental Security	Animal being abandoned and hunger and got COVID-19. Deforestation.
4	Personal Security	Domestic violence, criminal act (homicide, street violence, vandalism) and stressful symptom.
5	Community Security	Ignorance, discriminated and rejected
6	Political Security	Critical National Infrastructure on pandemic and rights violations particularly on right to health, political repression
7		

Source: The author develops this table based on the data analysis.

- 68 International Center for Not-Profit Law (ICNL). "COVID-19 Civic Freedom Tracker." *ICNL Website*. Last modified 2022. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.icnl.org/covid19tracker/?location=&issue=9&date=&type=>
- 69 Ibid.
- 70 Article 19. "Coronavirus: Impact on Freedom of Expression." Last modified 2020. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.article19.org/68-coronavirus-impacts-on-freedom-of-expression/>
- 71 Sabit Irfani, Ricky Santoso Muharam, Sunarso Sunarso. "Keadilan Hak Asasi Manusia dalam Aksi Kamisan di Indonesia." *Jurnal HAM*, 13(1). (2022): 81-96. doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.30641/ham.2022.13.81-96

C. The Human Security Strategy on Pandemic

The Human Security Unit at the UN made details the UNDP concept on human security in *the Human Security in theory and Practice*. It is explained specifically on how to operationalize the human security concept. It starts from looking at the operational perspective that looks into five characters of human security: (i) people-centered, (ii) multi- sectoral, (iii) comprehensive, (iv) context-specific, and (v) prevention-oriented.⁷² In addition, human security employs a hybrid approach that brings together these elements through a protection and empowerment framework.

With regard to human security strategy to pandemic, the following framework can be taken into account adapted from human security framework and adjusted to the pandemic situation.

Table 4.
Type of Covid-19/Pandemic Strategy and capacities under Human Security Framework

Human Security Components	Strategies to enhance protection and empowerment	Capacities needed
Economic Security	Access to basic income; Private sector and self-employment	Economic capital Human capital
Food Security	Entitlement of basic necessity	Assuring local and national distribution
Health Security	Access to basic health care and health services Safeguarding the health supplies and health worker	Assuring local and national distribution ⁷⁵ Universal basic education and knowledge on health and related ⁷⁵ ters; Access to information and community-based knowledge creation; Health critical infrastructure

⁷² UNDP. Loc. Cit.

Environmental Security	Sustainable practices for animal protection. Early warning mechanism.	Animal protection strategy. Natural resource capital.
Personal Security	Rule of Law Protection of human rights Gender –based treatment	Coping mechanism Adaptive strategy Gender-based channel
Community Security	Explicit and enforced protection of ethnic groups and community identity Protection from oppressive traditional practices, harsh treatment toward women, or discrimination against persons and family of COVID-19 and/or minority group.	Social capital Coping capital Adaptive strategies Memory of past disaster Local non-governmental organisation / tradition organisms
Political Security	Protection of human rights Protection from political or state repression	Good governance Ethical standards Accountability mechanism

Source: Human Security Unit of United Nations from the book on Human Security Theory and Practice combined with the author analysis on COVID-19.

Table 4 above is taken from the analysis of the overall human security components regarding COVID-19 threat in correspond to the strategy and capacity need to handle the threat. The strategy and the need are common to all states and/or related to best practices by looking into similar pandemic situation. Looking into past history, many countries have neglected some dimensions related to health in facing the pandemic. According to self-assessment made by WHO member countries, even though there is an improvement over the year (between 2013 and 2014), there is still a lack of health system capacity in terms of preparedness, human resource capacity and at points of entry

including airport and ports.⁷³ The key problem is in relation to failure of information and technology, including health information system, community mobilization strategy, health worker protective equipment, rapid diagnostic test, vaccine, and therapeutics especially in lower income countries such as countries in Africa region.⁷⁴ It corresponds to the capacity needed proposed in the framework related to health, particularly on health critical infrastructure in Asia region, which are rich of cultural diversity, underlines the important of ethical and legal aspects of pandemic planning to be appropriate to local context.⁷⁵ It is not suggested to look at the security issue into a national security perspective, but rather than taking into consideration insecurity of individuals.⁷⁶

In relation to human rights perspective, all of the seven factors need to be taken into account on the human rights perspective. Taking an example on the health security factor, the attention should be taking into account on the special need of individual including the one with the schizophrenia. In Indonesian context, the right of people with schizophrenia are less protected. It can be seen in the minimum of policy and instruments at local level to support it.⁷⁷

The WHO acknowledged the need of data and research from many disciplines to tackle health, economic, and social challenges caused

by COVID-19.⁷⁸ The meeting held in Geneva on 11-12 February 2020 where the scientists, member states representatives, public health professional, donors and private sectors representatives came to consensus on priority to speed up the response to COVID-19.⁷⁹ Social sciences marked the most, which includes psychology, anthropology, behavioral science, political science, and social epidemiology that helps official to develop and implement policy.⁸⁰ The overall of social science approach is linked to human security approach to strategy. Coping mechanism, in term of personal security, is relevant to be addressed especially in relation to overcome the frustration and stressful because of lockdown and/or 'stay-home' policy as discussed in the earlier section. The mechanism suggested by experts is related to development of exercises though development of a peer-support group.⁸¹

Most countries got their economy hit. Countries like United Kingdom, Belgium, France, and the Netherlands have developed a multi-sector single country computable model.⁸² The model-analyzed sectors caused by pandemic in order to mobilize sources for economic capital, which consists of agriculture, retail, hotels and restaurants, freight and public transport, tourism and travel, post and telecommunication, insurance, education, health and social work, non-essential items, and others.⁸³ The scenario of modeling identified that retail was the most impacted in Belgium and France, similar to UK and the Netherlands, but only that UK had smaller impact in agriculture whereas the Netherlands almost

- 73 GHRF Commission (2016) (2016) a Global Health Risk Framework for the Future). *The neglected dimension of global security: A framework to counter infectious disease crises*. Commission on GHRF: 2016.
- 74 Lawrence O. Gostin. "Global Health Security After Ebola: Four Global Commissions." *The Milbank Quarterly*, 94(1). (2016): 34-38
- 75 Belinda Bennett and Terry Carney. "Pandemic Preparedness in Asia: A Role for Law and Ethics?" *Asia Pacific Journal of Public Health*, 23(3). (2011): 419-430.
- 76 Joao Nunes. "Questioning health security: Insecurity and domination in world politics." *Review of International Studies*, 40(5). (2014): 939-960.
- 77 Firdaus Firdaus. "Rencana Aksi Nasional Hak Asasi Manusia Pro Environment (Studi Dampak Pertambangan Timah di Provinsi Bangka Belitung) The National Action Plan For Human Rights Pro Environment (The Study Of The Stannary Mining Impact in Bangka Belitung Province)." *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 7(1).(2017): 27-40.

- 78 World Health Organisation. *Coronavirus disease: Country Report*. WHO Coronavirus (Covid-19) Dashboard: 2021). last modified 2022, accessed June 17, 2022. <https://covid19.who.int>
- 79 Ibid.
- 80 Ibid.
- 81 Matias, Loc. Cit.
- 82 Marcus Richard Keogh-Brown, Richard D, John D. Edmunds, and Beutels, P. "The macroeconomic impact of pandemic influenza: Estimates from models of the United Kingdom, France, Belgium and The Netherlands." *The European Journal of Health Economics*, 11(6). (2010): 543-554.
- 83 Ibid: 547.

with no impact.⁸⁴ Human capital strategy can look at Japan and South Korea. These countries have a stable unemployment rate during time of crisis, such as COVID-19. The Bloomberg economist Justin Jimenez analyzed these caused by the structural labor market rigidities in economy.⁸⁵

Country cannot work alone. It needs help from global community which might include stimulus packages with explicit actions to improve the economic situation of the developing countries, a sustained cooperation with financial support sector to support business especially small enterprises and solve the structural challenges related to economic.⁸⁶ The International Labour Organisation indicated 25 million over unemployment worldwide because of COVID-19, which leads to a situation where country should prepare a scenario of placing a decent work, health, and educational opportunity for all especially for the poor and vulnerable ones.⁸⁷

Food security and environment security have relation to natural resources. Natural capital need to be accounted seriously by taking into account Common Agricultural Policies (CAP) through (1) having a balance sheet of natural assets to consider future liability⁵⁸ including its advantage in term of crisis; (2) creating a natural capital balance sheet; (3) providing assets for maintenance; (4) compensation and offsetting when damage occur⁵⁸ especially in term of crisis such as pandemic; (5) a p⁵⁸ for rebuilding natural capital assets base; (6) embedding natural capital into public policy.⁸⁸ The availability of the natural capital can secure the availability of the food.

Social capital develops to another set of need to have in relation to community security. It provides benefits in time of crisis and it shows that the high social capital community respond more

effectively than those with low social capital.⁸⁹ There are three types of social capitals: (1) bounding; (2) Bridging; and (3) linking. Each of them is linked to another and distinct because each represents different element of social capitals. In relation to COVID-19, these three types of social capital are necessary of effective response and sustainable recovery. The use of technology and/or social media can also be helpful.⁹⁰

Each of seven factors does not work alone. They enforce one another which make the framework work. The vulnerability should be assessed in developing the strategy and capacity affected in the community as well as assessment help to prevent and mitigate reassurance of insecurities.⁹¹ The framework is working in the light of protection and empowerment by designing the strategy bottom-up and top-down approaches.⁹²

In Indonesia context, the opportunity of having the human security approach to Pandemic is possible in the lense of human rights. Indonesia has National Action Plan on Human Rights. The action can be a powerful tool policy implementation of pro good and healthy environment,⁹³ as can be regarded as human security.

D. State Strategy to Covid-19

Under the human rights context, the responsibility to respect, protect and fulfill the rights is on the State. In regard to human security approach to respond to the pandemic, the state can make an active response by using the strategy as means to respect, protect and fulfill the rights. Such responsibility can be integrated in the state policy through policy on human rights. Indonesia has this action and equipped with the services by the regional office of Law and Human

84 Ibid: 548.

85 ⁵⁰ ayani, Loc. Cit.

86 Kanupriya. "COVID-19: A Socio-economic Perspective." *FIIIB Business Review*, 9(3). (2020): 161-166.

87 Ibid: 162. ⁴⁵

88 Dieter Helm. "Taking natural capital seriously." *Oxford Review of Economic Policy*, 30(1). 2014: 109-125.

⁸⁷ Nicholas Pitas and Colin Ehmer. "Social Capital in the Response to COVID-19." *American Journal of Health Promotion*. Volume: 34 Issue: 8. (2020): 942-944.

90 Ibid: 943.

91 United Nations Trust Fund for Human Security. Loc. Cit.

92 Ibid.

93 Firdaus, F. Op. Cit: 28.

Rights.⁹⁴ Certainly, it needs to be supported of the good governance and its assurance such as monitoring the performance of the state apparatus in giving public service. Indonesia has an effort on this in relation to the establishment of Integrity Zone (ZI), Free Corruption Zone (WBK), and Serving and Bureaucracy Zone (WBBM),⁹⁵ which is supported through bureaucracy reform programme.⁹⁶ The existence of e-governance could also provide the prospect of effective strategy. As access to information is part of human rights, public information disclosure can maximize the monitoring system.⁹⁷ In Indonesia, the presence of SIMWAS (monitoring system application) could actually assist the management of the monitoring system,⁹⁸ which could be the instruments to assure the strategy of the human rights through human security framework.

Countries mentioned before have opportunity to use the human rights policy and maximize the policy implementation through the monitoring system. The aforementioned states described in this article are only those with data availability and correspond to human security, particularly on health security. It does not necessarily to be

best practices, but it can also be critics toward the policy.

In Samoa, a country with high degree of international tourism enforced a strict public health regulation.⁹⁹ It further stressed the important of having the well-equipped state of heart diagnostic facilities, public health control centers, and highly trained personnel on contagious disease.¹⁰⁰

In Brazil, the government decided to securitize health issue by putting COVID-19 as a matter of defense instead of public health.¹⁰¹ It has been highly criticized because it brings result of dangerous consequences. Specialists advocated the country for not framing the COVID-19 as conflict, but as a crisis that demands doctors and public health, not military generals.¹⁰² It might be the reason why currently Brazil is the third highest number cases of coronavirus in the world.¹⁰³

In Pakistan, the COVID-19 creates a severe condition, especially if the government decided to complete lockdown, instead individuals are encouraged to take steps towards minimizing risk by staying in the house and mobilizing themselves.¹⁰⁴ The government further calls for help from international communities for dealing with the pandemic.¹⁰⁵

Responsive countries usually have ability in planning and interagency coordination when they respond to national emergency preparedness such

- 85 Edward James Sinaga. "Optimalisasi Pelaksanaan Rencana Aksi Nasional Hak Asasi Manusia (Ranham) Pada Bidang Ham Kantor Wilayah Kementerian Hukum dan Ham DKI Jakarta (Optimization Of The Action Plan National Human Rights Of The Regional Office Of The Ministry And Law And Human Rights Of DKI Jakarta)." *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 10(2). (2017): 141-161.
- 94 Edward James Sinaga. "Optimalisasi Pelaksanaan Rencana Aksi Nasional Hak Asasi Manusia (Ranham) Pada Bidang Ham Kantor Wilayah Kementerian Hukum dan Ham DKI Jakarta (Optimization Of The Action Plan National Human Rights Of The Regional Office Of The Ministry And Law And Human Rights Of DKI Jakarta)." *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 10(2). (2017): 141-161.
- 95 Zaihan Harmaen Anggayudha and Jody Imam Rafsanjani. "Information and Technology-Based Policy Strategy for Monitoring and Evaluation of Government Agencies with Corruption-Free Zone/ Serving and Clean Bureaucracy Zone Status." *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 16 (1). (2022): 175-194.
- 96 Haryono. "Pelaksanaan Reformasi Birokrasi Di Kementerian Hukum Dan Ham RI (Implementation of Bureaucracy Reform in The Ministry of Justice and Human Rights)." *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 10(3). (2017): 227-242.
- 97 Trisapto Nugroho. "Analisis E-Government Terhadap Pelayanan Publik Di Kementerian Hukum dan Ham (Analysis Of E-Government To Public Services In The Ministry Of Law And Human Rights)." *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 10(3). (2017): 279-296.
- 98 Oki Wahyu Budijanto. "Mekanisme Pengawasan Intern Kementerian Hukum dan Hak Asasi Manusia." *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 14(2). (2020). 313-338.

- 99 Lawal Olatunji Olayemi, Ramona Boodoosingh, & Filipina Amosa-Lei Sam. "Is Samoa Prepared for an Outbreak of COVID-19?" *Asia Pacific Journal of Public Health*. 33(6-7). (2021):797-798.
- 100 Ibid: 798.
- 101 Theus Hoffmann Pfrimer and Ricardo Barbosa, Jr. "Brazil's war on COVID-19: Crisis, not conflict—Doctors, not generals." *Dialogues in Human Geography*. Volume: 10 Issue: 2, page(s): 137-140
- 102 Ibid: 139.
- 103 News Desk. "Brazil Jumps to Third In COVID-19 Cases Worldwide." *The Jakarta Post*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2020/05/19/brazil-jumps-to-55-d-in-covid-19-cases-worldwide.html>
- 104 Khadijah Abid, Yashika Abdul Bari, Maryam Yonas, Sehar Tahir Javaid, and Abira Imran. "Progress of COVID-19 Epidemic in Pakistan". *Asia Pacific Journal of Public Health*. (2020): 1-3.
- 105 Ibid: 2.

as Taiwan, Singapore, and South Korea.¹⁰⁶ Taiwan initiated health checkup in international airport for the passengers came from Wuhan.¹⁰⁷ In 2012, Taiwan has released the third edition of pandemic guideline that identified five lines of defense to pandemic; (1) limiting travel abroad; (2) border control; (3) control on epidemic handling in community; (4) maintenance of function and health system, and; (5) protection for individual and family (Ibid). The government of Taiwan activates Center Epidemic Command Center (CECC) to integrate resources and cross-sectoral coordination.¹⁰⁸

In relation to coordination, Singapore developed the inter-ministerial committee (Ibid). The Country also develops a comprehensive pandemic mitigation system called Disease Outbreak Response System Condition, which proven to be effective to prevent the spread of COVID-19.¹⁰⁹ The country implements social distancing and quarantine policy strictly through internet-based system in education and businesses, stay-home-notice, until fine up to SGD 10.000 for breaching the regulation, including six months of imprisonment.¹¹⁰ All people who enter Singapore and show indication of fever and hard breathing are obliged to undergo COVID-19 test in the assigned check points.¹¹¹ The country routinely updates the latest information, subsidized COVID-19 check-up for Singapore citizen and permanent residence and actively collects fund, called Courage Fund, to be channeled to community with different kind of assistance skims.

In South Korea, Korea Center for Disease

¹⁰⁶ Wawan Mas'udi and Poppy S. Winanti, eds., *Tata Kelola Penanganan Covid-19 Di Indonesia: Kajian Awal*, 1st ed. (Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press, 2020): 34; ⁹⁷

¹⁰⁷ Poppy Winataska B. Darmawan, Treviliana E. Putri. 2020. "Komparasi Kebijakan N¹⁰⁵a: Menakar Kesiapan dan Kesigapan Menangani Covid-19." *Tata Kelola Penanganan COVID-19 di Indonesia: Kajian Awal*. 1st ed. (Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press, 2020): 19-34.

¹⁰⁸ Ibid: 22.

¹⁰⁹ Ibid: 25.

¹¹⁰ Ibid: 27

¹¹¹ Ibid: 26.

Control Prevention (KCDCP) under Ministry of Health and Welfare (MoHW) is responsible to conduct test in community and handling positive cases. Each municipal organizes Local Disaster and Safety Countermeasures Headquarters which is led by regional government to determine hospital provided for infectious disease and additional capacity. The country implements Enhanced Social Distancing Campaign that closed religious places, gym, and entertainment places including fine of 3 million KRW for business who breach the rule. South Korea also supports funding assistance for industry and business sector effected by COVID-19 and strengthening the policy related to COVID-19, which are channeled through voucher consumption, tax reduction, and rent facilities reduction. The financial support is further added to fund for the family allowance, prevention and treatment of the COVID-19, supports for household and local and small and medium enterprises.¹¹²

In contrast, even though the government of United States of America has conducted some supports to prevent, treat and reduce the COVID-19, but the country has to pay his earlier 'ignorance' and 'underestimated' comments made by the president that led to slow response toward COVID-19. President Donald Trump tends to give speculative comments and no evidence supports to his opinion including related to vaccines and time when COVID-19 end.¹¹³ The country is now one of the top countries with cases of COVID-19.

CONCLUSION

The COVID-19 affected human is a threat to human life that plausibly uses the human security framework for responding the threat. In order to effectively use the framework, the seven factors need to be considered and how it interacts to one another. The set of human security framework to COVID-19 is taken from systematical analysis of the common effect as threat and reasonable strategy and equitable need in most country and/

¹¹² Ibid: 23

¹¹³ Ibid: 24.

or based on research made by scientist. It will be tricky when the framework operationalizes at the state level if only based on this article. This article only describes the general overview of the human security of pandemic in the world. It only provides as vision if state plans to use human security in respond to the pandemic.

It is important that State integrates the human rights perspective through human security approach by assuring the mechanism through monitoring system and management of e-government for effective and efficiency the use of the strategy. The human rights perspective through human security framework which responds to Pandemic actually aims to improve the management of crisis in regard to pandemic in sustainable way. The general framework that has been developed in this study might help to identify the contextual-state approach on human rights perspective through human security framework.

RECOMMENDATION

The global pandemic is something that state needs to take a lesson to respond for the possible next pandemic in more human orientation approach. The human rights perspective through human security framework aims to accommodate the individual aspect of security and rights for more sustain and strategic method in responding the Pandemic. However, the study has to be supported with the state context, which cannot be generalized using the framework addressed in this study.

Thus, the study suggests the state to develop its human security approach with its specific strategies that correspond to state level needs and obstacles. Different state has different situation in specific issues, but they have some similarities. The similarities are taken into account into this article, which cannot be the sole argument for the state strategies. In the state level, one of the most common strategies is accuracy in data and information and funding supports. The things make difference in term of successfulness is when the state seriously commits to handle to pandemic through words and deeds.

To cope with negative impact of COVID-19 pandemic using human rights and human security approach at national level, the state needs to pay attention of the seven sectors of the human security approach for the most marginalized and at risk of being left behind. Different country may perceive different group at risk. For example, migrant China in US might pose greater risk to be discriminated because the population tended to acknowledge Covid-19 caused by China. It is similar in UK with BAME immigrants. However, in Indonesia, people living in poor and rural area have problems in accessing the treatment. They are also excluded by community as the case of rejected dead person in East Java. In Japan, woman has to get more attention as the woman suicide is increased during the Pandemic.

APPRECIATION

The study can be completed because of positive support from the Bhayangkara Jakarta Raya University to conduct the research. A token of appreciation is also given to International Organisations namely UNODC and UNDP, especially under Guyub Project, that have given the opportunity for the author as the researcher to be engaged in human security programme in order to acquire in-depth knowledge on human security.

REFERENCES

- 112 Abid, K⁷¹, Bari, Y. A., Younas, M., Tahir Javid, S., Javaid, S., and Imran, A. "Progress of COVID-19 Epidemic in Pakistan". *Asia Pacific Journal of Public Health*. (2020): 1-3).
- 25 Agren, David. "Mexico murder rate reaches new high as violence rage amid Covid-19 spread". *The Guardian*.²⁸st modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2020/apr/03/mexico-murder-rate-homicide-coronavirus-covid-19>
- 13 Amarasari, Indah. "Keamanan Nasional dalam Konteks Isu-isu Global Kontemporer: Sebuah Tinjauan Hubungan Internasional". *Jurnal Keamanan Nasional*, Vol 3 No. 1. (2017):109.

- Andersen, G. Kristian; Rambaut, Andrew; Lipkin, Ian; Holm⁴⁴ C. Edward; Garry, F. Robert. (2020). "The proximal origin of SARS-CoV-2." *Nature Medicine*, 26 (4). (2020): 450-252.
- Anggayudha, Z., and Rafsanjani, J. "Information and Technology-Based Policy Strategy for Monitoring and Evaluation of Government Agencies with Corruption-Free Zone/ Serving and Clean Bureaucracy Zone Status." *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 16 (1). (2022): 175-194.
- Article 19. "Coronavirus: Impact on Freedom of Expression." Last modified 2020. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.article19.org/coronavirus-impacts-on-freedom-of-expression/>
- Austin, D. "Fatty Acids, breastfeeding and autism spectrum disorder." *E-journal of Applied Psychology*, 5(1). (2009): 49-52. <http://ojs/lib.swin.edu.au/>
- Baylis, John. *The Globalisation of World Politics: An Introduction to International Relations Third Edition*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- BBC News. "Japan's suicide rate rises during Pandemic." *YouTube*. Uploaded by BBC News 8 February 2021. Last modified 2020. Last modified 2021. Accessed June 17, 2022. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=avirbVbeVEk>
- Bennett, B., & Carney, T. "Pandemic Preparedness in Asia: A Role for Law and Ethics?" *Asia Pacific Journal of Public Health*, 23(3). (2011): 419-430.
- Bosch⁴⁹ David and Sascha Werthes. *Human Security in Practice: Canadian and Japanese Experiences*. International Politics and Society, 2005.
- Bojang, AS. "The Study of Foreign Policy in International Relations." *J Pol Sci Pub Aff* 6 (2018): 337doi:10.4172/2332-0761.1000337
- Bruns, D. P., Kraguljac, N. V., and Bruns, T. R. "COVID-19: Facts, Cultural Considerations, and Risk of Stigmatization." *Journal of Transcultural Nursing*. 31(4). (2020): 326-332
- Budijanto, O. "Mekanisme Pengawasan Intern Kementerian Hukum dan Hak Asasi Manusia." *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 14(2). (2020). 313-338.
- Buzzan, Barry, Ole Wæver and Jaap de Wilde. *Security: A new Framework for Analysis*. Boulder, Col.: Lynne-Rienner Publishers, 1998.
- Campbell, Andrew M. "An increasing risk of family violence during the Covid-19 pandemic: Strengthening community collaborations to save lives." *Forensic Science International: Reports* Vol 2, December. (2020): 1-3.
- Chen, Daniel T.-H., and Yi-Jen Wang. "Inequality-Related Health and Social Factors and Their Impact on Well-Being during the COVID-19 Pandemic: Findings from a National Survey in the UK." *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*. Vol 18, no. 3. (2021): 1-9.
- Commission on Human Security. *Human Security Now: Final Report*, New York: CHS, 2003.
- Clamp, Rachel. "Coronavirus and the Black Death: Spread of Misinformation and Xenophobia Shows We Haven't Learned from Our Past." *The Conversation*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://theconversation.com/coronavirus-and-the-black-death-spread-of-misinformation-and-xenophobia-shows-we-havent-learned-from-our-past-132802>
- Clarke⁴⁷ Robert. "Critical National Infrastructures", *Business Continuity and the Pandemic Threat*. (United Kingdom: IT Governance Publishing, 2016).
- Chiwaya, Nigel. "The coronavirus has destroyed the job market in very states." *NBC News*. Last modified 2021. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.nbcnews.com/business/economy/unemployment-claims-state-see-how-covid-19-has-destroyed-job-n1183686>
- Daly, Natasha. "Tiger tests positive for coronavirus at Bronx Zoo, first known case in the world." *National Geographic*. Last modified 2021. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.nationalgeographic.com/animals/2020/04/>

- [tiger-coronavirus-covid19-positive-test-bronx-zoo/](#)
- 16 Dwinantoaji, H., and Sumami, D. W. "Human security, social stigma, and global health: the COVID-19 pandemic in Indonesia." *Journal of the Medical Sciences (Berkala Ilmu Kedokteran)*, 52(3). (2020): 158-165.
- European Network for National Human Rights Institution. *A human rights-based approach to COVID-19 economic response and recovery - protecting jobs, SMEs and workers, including in the context of national recovery and resilience plans*. Belgium: ENNHRI, 2022.
- Firdaus, F. "Rencana Aksi Nasional Hak Asasi Manusia Pro Environment (Studi Dampak Pertambangan Timah di Provinsi Bangka Belitung) The National Action Plan For Human Rights Pro Environment (The Study Of The Stannary Mining Impact in Bangka Belitung Province)." *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 7(1).(2017): 27-40.
- 23 Firdaus, F. "Pemenuhan Hak Atas Kesehatan Bagi Penyandang Skizofrenia di Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta (Rights Fulfillment on Health of People With Schizophrenia In Special Region of Yogyakarta)." *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 10(1). (2016): 87-103.
- GHRF Commission (Commission on a Global Health Risk Framework for the Future). *The neglected dimension of global security: A framework to counter infectious disease crises*. Commission on GHRF: 2016.
- Glasser, Robert. "The Pandemic Threat to Human Security." *HuffPost*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. https://www.huffpost.com/entry/the-pandemic-threat-to-hu_b_9252494
- 19 Gostin, L. "Global Health Security After Ebola: Four Global Commissions." *The Milbank Quarterly*, 94(1). (2016): 34-38.
- Granoff, Johnathan & Kellman, Barry. "The National Security is too crude to protect us from pandemic. It's time to shift to human security instead." *Newsweek*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.newsweek.com/human-security-national-security-covid-19-coronavirus-1492830>
- 7 Harris, M. (2011, August 16). "Grades improve if classes start later, studies find." *The Calgary Herald*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <http://www.calgaryherald.com/>
- Haryono, H. "Pelaksanaan Reformasi Birokrasi Di Kementerian Hukum Dan Ham RI (Implementation of Bureaucracy Reform in The Ministry of Justice and Human Rights)." *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 10(3). (2017): 227-242.
- Helm, D. "Taking natural capital seriously." *Oxford Review of Economic Policy*, 30(1). 2014: 109-125.
- Hu, Yang. "Intersecting ethnic and native-migrant inequalities in the economic impact of the COVID-19 pandemic in the UK". *Research in Social Stratification and Mobility*, Volume 68. (2020): 1-6.
- Ilja Richard Pavone. "Infectious Diseases as a New Threat to International Peace and Security: The Security Council and the Securitization of Health." *Völkerrechtsblog*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020.
- 17 International Center for Not-Profit Law (ICNL). "COVID-19 Civic Freedom Tracker." *ICNL Website*. Last modified 2022. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.icnl.org/covid19tracker/?location=&issue=9&date=&type=>
- Irfani, S., Muharam, R., and Sunarso, S. "Keadilan Hak Asasi Manusia dalam Aksi Kamisan di Indonesia." *Jurnal HAM*, 13(1). (2022): 81-96.
- 50 Kanupriya. "COVID-19: A Socio-economic Perspective." *FIIIB Business Review*, 9(3). (2020): 161-166.
- 6 Karim, Ammar. "In Iraq, no resting place for coronavirus dead." *The Jakarta Post*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2020/03/30/in-iraq-no-resting-place-for-coronavirus-dead.html>
- Keogh-Brown, M., Smith, R., Edmunds, J., and Beutels, P. "The macroeconomic impact of pandemic influenza: Estimates from models of the United Kingdom, France, Belgium and The Netherlands." *The European Journal of Health Economics*, 11(6). (2010): 543-554.

- Kim, Allen. "Cats and dogs abandoned at the start of the coronavirus outbreak are now starving or being killed." *NV*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://edition.cnn.com/2020/03/15/asia/coronavirus-animals-pets-trnd/index.html>
- Kompas. "Angka kriminalitas Jakarta meningkat 10% selama Pandemi Covid-19." *Kompas*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2020/04/27/15420281/angka-kriminalitas-di-jakarta-meningkat-10-persen-selama-pandemi-covid-19>
- Purba, Kornelis. "When your dead body is rejected everywhere." Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. *The Jakarta Post*. <https://www.thejakartapost.com/academia/2020/04/08/when-your-dead-body-is-rejected-everywhere.html>
- Lemieux T, Milligan K, Schirle T, Skuterud M. 2020. "Initial impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic on the Canadian labour market". *University of Toronto Journal*, Volume 46 Issue S1. (2020): S66-S81
- Mas'udi, Wawan and Poppy S. Winati. *Tata Kelola Penanganan COVID-19 di Indonesia: Kajian Awal*. Yogyakarta: Gajah Mada Press. 2020.
- Matias, T., Dominski, F. H., & Marks, D. F. "Human needs in COVID-19 isolation." *Journal of Health Psychology*, 24 (6). (2020): 833-843.
- Newman, Edward. "Covid-19: A Human Security Analysis." *Global Society*, 29 (12). (2021): 1-24.
- News Desk. "Brazil Jumps to Third In COVID-19 Cases Worldwide." *The Jakarta Post*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020 <https://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2020/05/19/brazil-jumps-to-third-in-covid-19-cases-worldwide.html>
- Nunes, J. "Questioning health security: Insecurity and domination in world politics." *Review of International Studies*, 40(5). (2014): 939-960.
- Nugroho, T. "Analisis E-Government Terhadap Pelayanan Publik Di Kementerian Hukum dan Ham (Analysis Of E-Government To Public Services In The Ministry Of Law And Human Rights)." *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 10(3). (2017): 279-296.
- Olayemi, L. O., Boodoosingh, R., & Amosa-Lei Sam, F. "Is Samoa Prepared for an Outbreak of COVID-19?" *Asia Pacific Journal of Public Health*. 33(6-7). (2021):797-798.
- Perry BL, Aronson B, Pescosolido BA. 2021. "Pandemic precarity: COVID-19 is exposing and exacerbating inequalities in the American heartland". *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A*. Feb 23, 2021. <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/33547252/>
- Peterman A, Potts A, O'Donnell M, et al. "Pandemics and violence against women and children." *Center for Global Development Working Paper 528*, April 2020. <http://iawmh.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/04/pandemics-and-vawg-april2.pdf>
- Pfimer, M. H., and Barbosa Jr, R. "Brazil's war on COVID-19: Crisis, not conflict—Doctors, not generals." *Dialogues in Human Geography*. Volume: 10 issue: 2, page(s): 137-140
- Pitas, N. and Ehmer, C. "Social Capital in the Response to COVID-19." *American Journal of Health Promotion*. Volume: 34 issue: 8. (2020): 942-944.
- Prasetyo, R. "Pandemi Covid-19: Perspektif Hukum Tata Negara Darurat dan Perlindungan HAM." *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 15(2). (2021): 327-346.
- Purba, Kornelis. "When your dead body is rejected everywhere." Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. *The Jakarta Post*. <https://www.thejakartapost.com/academia/2020/04/08/when-your-dead-body-is-rejected-everywhere.html>
- Scipioni, Jade. "Why there will soon be tons of toilet paper, and what food may be scarce, according to supply chain experts." *NBC*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.cnbc.com/2020/03/18/supply-chain-experts-foods-that-could-be-less-available-in-pandemic.html>

- Scott, John. "This Is The Human Impact Of Covid-19-And How Business Can Help." *World Forum Economic*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2020/03/this-is-the-human-impact-of-covid-19-and-how-business-can-help/>
- Sinaga, E. "Optimalisasi Pelaksanaan Rencana Aksi Nasional Hak Asasi Manusia (Ranham) Pada Bidang Ham Kantor Wilayah Kementerian Hukum dan Ham DKI Jakarta (Optimization Of The Action Plan Of National Human Rights Of The Regional Office Of The Ministry And Law And Human Rights Of DKI Jakarta)." *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 10(2). (2017): 141-161.
- Sofaer, S. "Qualitative Methods: What Are They And Why Use Them?." *Health Services Research*. Dec; 34(5 Pt 2). (1999): 1101-1111
- Tavernise, Sabrina and Richard A. Oppel, Jr. "Spit on, Yelled at, Attacked: Chinese-American fear of their safety." *New York Times*. Last modified 2021. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/03/23/us/chinese-coronavirus-racist-attacks.html>
- Taylor, Michael. "Deforestation risk rise as the coronavirus hindered the SE protection." *Reuters*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.reuters.com/article/health-coronavirus-deforestation/deforestation-risks-rise-as-coronavirus-hinders-se-asia-protection-idUSL8N2BJ12Z>
- The New York Time Editorial. "Here Comes the Coronavirus Pandemic: Now, after many fire drills, the world may be facing a real fire." *The New York Times*. Last modified 2021. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/02/29/opinion/sunday/corona-virus-usa.html>
- The New York Times. "A List of What's Been Canceled Because of Coronavirus." Last modified 2021. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.nytimes.com/article/cancelled-events-coronavirus.html>
- United Nations Trust Fund for Human Security. *Human Security Handbook*. UN: Human Security Unit, 2016.
- _____. *Human Security in Theory and Practice*. New York: United Nations, 2009.
- _____. "COVID-19: Depression, anxiety soared 25 per cent in a year." *News UN*. Last modified 2022. Accessed June 17, 2022. <https://news.un.org/en/story/2022/03/1113162>
- United Nations Development Program (UNDP). *Human Development Report 1994. New Dimensions of Human Security*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1994.
- Utami, Budi N., and Mellynda, O. "Conjugal Visit: Juridical Review of the Fulfilment of Inmates' Rights in the Correctional Perspective." *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum*, 16(1). (2022): 97-118.
- VICE News. "Japan Is Facing an Alarming Spike in Female Suicides." *YouTube*. Uploaded by VICE News 1 July 2021. Last modified 2020. Last modified 2021. Accessed June 17, 2022.
- Vidya-Mitra. "Human Security or Human Rights." *YouTube*. Uploaded by Vidya-Mitra 12 September 2017. Last modified 2020. Last modified 2017. Accessed June 17, 2022. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?app=desktop&v=-Blm02GO3UA>
- Wanqing, Zhang. "Domestic violence cases surge during COVID-19 epidemic." *Sixth Tone*. Last modified 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.sixthtone.com/news/1005253/domestic-violence-cases-surge-during-covid-19-epidemic>
- World Health Organisation. *Coronavirus disease: Country Report*. WHO Coronavirus (Covid-19) Dashboard: 2021). <https://covid19.who.int>
- World Health Organisation. "Scientific Brief: Mental Health and COVID-19: Early evidence of the pandemic's impact." *WHO*. Last modified 2020. Last modified 2022. Accessed June 17, 2022. https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/WHO-2019-nCoV-Sci_Brief-Mental_health-2022.1
- Winanti, Poppy, Paska B. Darmawan, Treviliana E. Putri. "Komparasi Kebijakan Negara: Analisis Kesiapan dan Kesiapan Menangani Covid-19." *Tata Kelola Penanganan*

COVID-19 di Indonesia: Kajian Awal.
Yogyakarta: Gajah Mada Press. 2020.

Wirayani, Prima. "As COVID-19 bites, Current Labor Rules Can Protect Jobs." *The Jakarta Post*, 2020. Accessed May 5, 2020. <https://www.thejakartapost.com/academia/2020/04/30/as-covid-19-bites-current-labor-rules-can-protect-jobs.html>

Witteveen, Dirk. "Socio demographic inequality in exposure to COVID-19-induced economic hardship in the United Kingdom", *Research in Social Stratification and Mobility*, Volume 69. (2020): 1-10

THE STUDY ON THE CORONAVIRUS PANDEMIC USING HUMAN RIGHTS AND HUMAN SECURITY APPROACH

ORIGINALITY REPORT

22%
SIMILARITY INDEX

16%
INTERNET SOURCES

9%
PUBLICATIONS

10%
STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1 Submitted to Adtalem Global Education, Inc. <1%
Student Paper

2 Submitted to CSU, San Jose State University <1%
Student Paper

3 journals.rcni.com <1%
Internet Source

4 www.maravipost.com <1%
Internet Source

5 John Corbett. "Chapter 13 'A Mild Dose of the Flu': The Discourse of the COVID-19 Crisis in Brazil and the Impact of the Pandemic on the Internationalization of Brazilian Higher Education", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2021 <1%
Publication

6 dailytimes.com.pk <1%
Internet Source

7 jurnal.ugm.ac.id <1%
Internet Source

8	www.kompas.com Internet Source	<1 %
9	Submitted to Bindura University of Science Education Student Paper	<1 %
10	Submitted to University of Liverpool Student Paper	<1 %
11	www.paluba.info Internet Source	<1 %
12	Submitted to Flagler College Student Paper	<1 %
13	eprints.umm.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
14	pacifichealthdialog.nz Internet Source	<1 %
15	Submitted to American University of Beirut Student Paper	<1 %
16	Gede Benny Setia Wirawan, Ngakan Putu Anom Harjana, Nur Wulan Nugrahani, Pande Putu Januraga. "Health Beliefs and Socioeconomic Determinants of COVID-19 Booster Vaccine Acceptance: An Indonesian Cross-Sectional Study", Vaccines, 2022 Publication	<1 %
17	he.player.fm Internet Source	<1 %

<1 %

18

www.studymode.com

Internet Source

<1 %

19

Kwabena Appiah- Sakyi, Manoj Mohan, Justin C Konje. "Ebola Infection in Pregnancy, an ongoing challenge for both the global health expert and the pregnant woman- A review", European Journal of Obstetrics & Gynecology and Reproductive Biology, 2020

Publication

<1 %

20

Moch. Marsa Taufiqurrohman, Muhammad Toriq Fahri, Robi Kurnia Wijaya, I Gede Putu Wiranata. "The Use of Necessitas Non Habet Legem and Wederspanningheid in Law Enforcement for Covid-19 Vaccination in Indonesia", Jurnal Penelitian Hukum De Jure, 2021

Publication

<1 %

21

www.newporthealthcare.com

Internet Source

<1 %

22

www.unfpa.org

Internet Source

<1 %

23

ijmhs.biomedcentral.com

Internet Source

<1 %

24

publications.aberdeenshire.gov.uk

Internet Source

<1 %

25

5dok.net

Internet Source

<1 %

26

Submitted to American University

Student Paper

<1 %

27

Submitted to College of Southern Nevada,
West Charleston Campus

Student Paper

<1 %

28

dossier3d.com

Internet Source

<1 %

29

epgp.inflibnet.ac.in

Internet Source

<1 %

30

Jumiati Siska, Hadiwinarto Hadiwinarto.
"Learning Islamic Religious Education in State
Elementary Schools Using Technology-Based
Media", Jurnal Basicedu, 2021

Publication

<1 %

31

Submitted to Defence Academy of the United
Kingdom

Student Paper

<1 %

32

determinantes.saude.bvs.br

Internet Source

<1 %

33

eprints.utas.edu.au

Internet Source

<1 %

34	larrysummers.com Internet Source	<1 %
35	Submitted to College of Europe Student Paper	<1 %
36	jurnal.arkainstitute.co.id Internet Source	<1 %
37	repository.uph.edu Internet Source	<1 %
38	statesassembly.gov.je Internet Source	<1 %
39	www.oxfordbibliographies.com Internet Source	<1 %
40	yaqeeninstitute.org Internet Source	<1 %
41	Submitted to King's Christian College Student Paper	<1 %
42	Submitted to Syiah Kuala University Student Paper	<1 %
43	Submitted to Zenith Education Group Student Paper	<1 %
44	ecronicon.com Internet Source	<1 %
45	idoc-pub.programaspc.net Internet Source	<1 %

46	paper.researchbib.com Internet Source	<1 %
47	Submitted to Regis High School Student Paper	<1 %
48	Submitted to Griffith University Student Paper	<1 %
49	Submitted to IBC Academy Student Paper	<1 %
50	kazanmedjournal.ru Internet Source	<1 %
51	Endra Wijaya, Mochamad Firmansyah Roni. "Praktik Pengelolaan Keuangan Desa dan Faktor-Faktor yang Memengaruhinya", Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum, 2019 Publication	<1 %
52	Submitted to University of Southern Mississippi Student Paper	<1 %
53	Ridoan Karim. "9 The Importance of Legal Services During the COVID-19 Pandemic", Walter de Gruyter GmbH, 2021 Publication	<1 %
54	pure.uvt.nl Internet Source	<1 %

55	Submitted to Chester College of Higher Education Student Paper	<1 %
56	Michelle M. Amri, Don Drummond. "Punctuating the equilibrium: an application of policy theory to COVID-19", Policy Design and Practice, 2020 Publication	<1 %
57	wiiw.ac.at Internet Source	<1 %
58	Helm, D.. "Taking natural capital seriously", Oxford Review of Economic Policy, 2014. Publication	<1 %
59	creakyjoints.org Internet Source	<1 %
60	repository.uki.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
61	web-tools.uts.edu.au Internet Source	<1 %
62	www.iza.org Internet Source	<1 %
63	Submitted to University of St. Gallen Student Paper	<1 %
64	documents.mx Internet Source	<1 %

65

www.tsos.org.tw

Internet Source

<1 %

66

Eve M. Valera. "When pandemics clash: Gendered violence-related traumatic brain injuries in women since COVID-19", *EClinicalMedicine*, 2020

Publication

<1 %

67

Farah N. Mawani, Virginia Gunn, Patricia O'Campo, Michelle Anagnostou et al. "COVID-19 Economic Response and Recovery: A Rapid Scoping Review", *International Journal of Health Services*, 2021

Publication

<1 %

68

Submitted to UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung

Student Paper

<1 %

69

Submitted to Xavier University

Student Paper

<1 %

70

brill.com

Internet Source

<1 %

71

digitalcommons.unl.edu

Internet Source

<1 %

72

files.eric.ed.gov

Internet Source

<1 %

73

hrbaportal.org

Internet Source

<1 %

74	www.reuters.com Internet Source	<1 %
75	Submitted to Otto-von-Guericke-Universität Magdeburg Student Paper	<1 %
76	Ruwan Bandara, Mario Fernando, Shahriar Akter. "Explicating the privacy paradox: A qualitative inquiry of online shopping consumers", Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services, 2020 Publication	<1 %
77	Schlickenmaier, William A.. "Playing the Generals' Game: Superpowers, Self-Limiting, and Strategic Emerging Technologies.", Georgetown University, 2020 Publication	<1 %
78	adoc.pub Internet Source	<1 %
79	thegwpost.files.wordpress.com Internet Source	<1 %
80	www.milbank.org Internet Source	<1 %
81	Submitted to CSU Northridge Student Paper	<1 %
82	Fenton, Adam James. "Combating Terror:Indonesia's Legislative and Law	<1 %

Enforcement Response to Terrorism", Charles Darwin University (Australia), 2022

Publication

83

Sarah Sarah. "Hegemoni Melalui Regulasi Virus Sharing Internasional: Studi Kasus Virus Flu Burung A (H5N1) Indonesia", Jurnal Penelitian Hukum De Jure, 2019

Publication

<1 %

84

ejournal.unsrat.ac.id

Internet Source

<1 %

85

pkn4all.blogspot.com

Internet Source

<1 %

86

studies.aljazeera.net

Internet Source

<1 %

87

www.degruyter.com

Internet Source

<1 %

88

www.kri.sfc.keio.ac.jp

Internet Source

<1 %

89

www.law.georgetown.edu

Internet Source

<1 %

90

www.opengovpartnership.org

Internet Source

<1 %

91

www.ukessays.com

Internet Source

<1 %

92 Jörg M. Fegert, Benedetto Vitiello, Paul L. Plener, Vera Clemens. "Challenges and burden of the Coronavirus 2019 (COVID-19) pandemic for child and adolescent mental health: a narrative review to highlight clinical and research needs in the acute phase and the long return to normality", Child and Adolescent Psychiatry and Mental Health, 2020
Publication <1 %

93 Submitted to Instituto de Empress S.L.
Student Paper <1 %

94 Submitted to Northern Valley Regional High School - Old Tappan
Student Paper <1 %

95 Submitted to Tulane University
Student Paper <1 %

96 globescan.com
Internet Source <1 %

97 ugmpress.ugm.ac.id
Internet Source <1 %

98 Submitted to Maria Carrillo High School
Student Paper <1 %

99 Submitted to Sogang University
Student Paper <1 %

Submitted to Hampton High School

100	Student Paper	<1 %
101	Submitted to University of the Western Cape Student Paper	<1 %
102	Submitted to Webster University Student Paper	<1 %
103	polmas.wordpress.com Internet Source	<1 %
104	Vanessa Pupavac. "Human security and the rise of global therapeutic governance", Conflict, Security & Development, 2006 Publication	<1 %
105	eprints.ums.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
106	www.cima.ned.org Internet Source	<1 %
107	www.mobt3ath.com Internet Source	<1 %
108	www.policyleadershipinstitute.org Internet Source	<1 %
109	digitalcommons.lmu.edu Internet Source	<1 %
110	easap.asia Internet Source	<1 %

111	dl.n.jaipuria.ac.in:8080 Internet Source	<1 %
112	www.igi-global.com Internet Source	<1 %
113	www.vagelos.columbia.edu Internet Source	<1 %
114	www.who.int Internet Source	<1 %
115	Victorio H Situmorang. "Kebebasan Beragama Sebagai Bagian dari Hak Asasi Manusia", Jurnal HAM, 2019 Publication	<1 %
116	adaletdergisi.adalet.gov.tr Internet Source	<1 %
117	fh.ubharajaya.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
118	journals.library.columbia.edu Internet Source	<1 %
119	journals.openedition.org Internet Source	<1 %
120	oeclass.aua.gr Internet Source	<1 %
121	repository.uinjkt.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %

122

www.clinicsinoncology.com

Internet Source

<1 %

123

Zhao, Longwen. "Spatio-Temporal Statistical Models for the Spread of Covid-19 Across Counties in the Contiguous United States", Saint Louis University, 2022

Publication

<1 %

Exclude quotes Off

Exclude matches Off

Exclude bibliography Off