



Muammar Qadafi <qadafim.mq@gmail.com>

Submission to Water Cycle - manuscript number

1 pesan

The Journal <em@editorialmanager.com>

21 Juli 2023 pukul 09.37

Balas Ke: The Journal <support@elsevier.com>

Kepada: Muammar Qadafi <qadafim.mq@gmail.com>

CC: "Diana Rahayuning Wulan" diana.rahayuning.wulan@brin.go.id, "Raden Tina Rosmalina" tinarosmalina@yahoo.com, "Retno Wulandari" retno.wulandari@ubharajaya.ac.id, "Wisnu Prayogo" wisnuprayogo@unimed.ac.id, "Rosetyati Retno Utami" rose002@brin.go.id, "Yusuf Eka Maulana" yusuf.eka69@gmail.com, "Suprihanto Notodarmojo" suprihantonotodarmojo@gmail.com, "Yuniati Zevi" yz59@cornell.edu

This is an automated message.

Manuscript Number: WATCYC-D-23-00044

Using UV-Vis differential absorbance spectra of tropical peat water DOM fraction to determine trihalomethanes formation potential and its estimated cytotoxicity

Dear Dr Qadafi,

Your above referenced submission has been assigned a manuscript number: WATCYC-D-23-00044.

To track the status of your manuscript, please log in as an author at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/watcyc/>, and navigate to the "Submissions Being Processed" folder.

Thank you for submitting your work to this journal.

Kind regards,
Water Cycle

More information and support

You will find information relevant for you as an author on Elsevier's Author Hub: <https://www.elsevier.com/authors>

FAQ: How can I reset a forgotten password?

https://service.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/28452/supporthub/publishing/

For further assistance, please visit our customer service site: <https://service.elsevier.com/app/home/supporthub/publishing/>

Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions, and learn more about Editorial Manager via interactive tutorials. You can also talk 24/7 to our customer support team by phone and 24/7 by live chat and email

#AU_WATCYC#

To ensure this email reaches the intended recipient, please do not delete the above code

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/watcyc/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.



Muammar Qadafi <qadafim.mq@gmail.com>

Decision on your submission to Water Cycle

1 pesan

Hongying Hu <em@editorialmanager.com>

21 Agustus 2023 pukul 15.14

Balas Ke: Hongying Hu <watercycle@mail.tsinghua.edu.cn>

Kepada: Muammar Qadafi <qadafim.mq@gmail.com>

Manuscript Number: WATCYC-D-23-00044

Using UV-Vis differential absorbance spectra of tropical peat water DOM fraction to determine trihalomethanes formation potential and its estimated cytotoxicity

Dear Dr Qadafi,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to Water Cycle.

I have completed my evaluation of your manuscript. The reviewers recommend reconsideration of your manuscript following revision. I invite you to resubmit your manuscript after addressing the comments below. Please resubmit your revised manuscript by Sep 20, 2023.

When revising your manuscript, please consider all issues mentioned in the reviewers' comments carefully: please outline in a cover letter every change made in response to their comments and provide suitable rebuttals for any comments not addressed. Please note that your revised submission may need to be re-reviewed.

To submit your revised manuscript, please log in as an author at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/watcyc/>, and navigate to the "Submissions Needing Revision" folder under the Author Main Menu.

Water Cycle values your contribution and I look forward to receiving your revised manuscript.

Kind regards,
Hongying Hu
Editor-in-Chief
Water Cycle

Editor and Reviewer Comments:

Reviewer #1: This study unraveled the relationship between UV-Vis differential absorbance and DOM fractions, DBPs formation potential, and cytotoxicity. The findings are presented in a clear and direct manner. Nevertheless, a few aspects require further clarification, giving rise to some questions. Hence, I recommend this manuscript to be finally accepted after a major revision, and believe the manuscript would be improved by considering the following remarks:

1. (Line 29 in Abstract) Please provide the full name of the abbreviation "THM4" when it appeared for the first time in the manuscript.
2. Given that the estimation of cytotoxicity for the disinfection byproducts (DBPs) was based on the reference by Elizabeth D. Wagner et al. (2017), it is advisable for the authors to consistently CLARIFY in the manuscript that the observed cytotoxicity pertains specifically to CHO CELLS. Otherwise, other readers may misinterpret the cytotoxicity as being directed towards other cells or microorganisms.
3. (Line 133) Please provide a clear description on how to calculate the estimated cytotoxicity in the methodology section.
4. In Fig. 1 (a), considering that the four fractions (HPOA, TPH, HPIC, and HPIN) exhibit varied properties and encompass diverse constituents, what underlies their unanimous peak absorbance at the wavelength of 277 nm?
5. Absence of error bars is observed in the columns depicted in Figure 2. Could this be attributed to the omission of parallel experiments?
6. Please add the cytotoxicity unit in Fig. 2 (d).
7. While chlorination of DOM leads to the generation of numerous disinfection byproducts beyond THMs, some of which might possess higher toxicity than THM4, the authors' attention is primarily directed towards a restricted subset

of THM4 species. How did the authors address the potential impact of these less-studied disinfection byproducts?

Reviewer #2: This manuscript investigated the relationship between absorbance differential spectra of tropical peat water DOM and THM4 formation potential in Indonesia. The results showed that the hydrophobic-acid fraction contained the highest concentration of DOC, THM4 production potential, and calculated cytotoxicity. And the hydrophilic-neutral fraction had the lowest potential THM4 production. The UV-Vis absorbance spectra of all DOM fractions showed a comparable peak at 277nm. The main conclusion of this study is that the absorbance differential spectra might be employed as a surrogate measure for the peat water DOM fraction and its precursor properties to form THM4 during the chlorination process, as well as its estimated cytotoxicity. Nonetheless, the limitations inherent in this paper are readily discernible. Considering the foregoing discussions, it is strongly recommended that the manuscript undergo substantial revision prior to its submission for consideration in Water Cycle. The suggestions are as follows:

1. A conspicuous limitation lies in the length of the article, which precludes a thorough and comprehensive exploration of the underlying issue. The content conveyed within the manuscript remains elementary and lacking in depth, leaving numerous scientific investigations unexplored. Notably absent are further investigations into critical aspects, including the properties of the fractions, mechanism of DBPs formation in different fractions, and the characteristics of the reactions involved. Regrettably, the article carries the semblance of an unfinished endeavor.
2. A particularly pioneering aspect of this study lies in the investigation of various fractions within the DOM water sample. To underscore its potential applications, a more comprehensive exposition of the envisaged scenarios is warranted.
3. Additional details concerning the quality parameters inherent to the DOM under examination are essential and should be included for contextual clarity.
4. The absence of error bars in the bar plots of Fig. 1 and Fig. 2, which depict DOC, UV277, DBPs formation potential, and calculated cytotoxicity, raises concerns about the diligence of the authors in proofreading. This oversight requires rectification.
5. The perplexing deviation of data points at $\Delta A_{277} = 4$ in Fig. 3b and Fig. 3g demands further elucidation. A more detailed explanation is necessary to alleviate confusion among readers.
6. The precise specifications of the fractions or entire water sample used for correlation analysis are absent. The omission of specific experimental conditions in Fig. 3 is an important gap that should be addressed to enhance the study's accuracy.
7. The analysis presented in Table 1 appears to lack clarity and comprehensiveness. It is imperative to engage in a more in-depth exploration of the interrelationships between the findings of this study and the outcomes of prior researches, thereby enriching the scholarly discourse.

More information and support

FAQ: How do I revise my submission in Editorial Manager?

https://service.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/28463/supporthub/publishing/

You will find information relevant for you as an author on Elsevier's Author Hub: <https://www.elsevier.com/authors>

FAQ: How can I reset a forgotten password?

https://service.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/28452/supporthub/publishing/

For further assistance, please visit our customer service site: <https://service.elsevier.com/app/home/supporthub/publishing/>

Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions, and learn more about Editorial Manager via interactive tutorials. You can also talk 24/7 to our customer support team by phone and 24/7 by live chat and email

At Elsevier, we want to help all our authors to stay safe when publishing. Please be aware of fraudulent messages requesting money in return for the publication of your paper. If you are publishing open access with Elsevier, bear in mind that we will never request payment before the paper has been accepted. We have prepared some guidelines (<https://www.elsevier.com/connect/authors-update/seven-top-tips-on-stopping-apc-scams>) that you may find helpful, including a short video on Identifying fake acceptance letters (<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=o5l8thD9XtE>). Please remember that you can contact Elsevier's Researcher Support team (<https://service.elsevier.com/app/home/supporthub/publishing/>) at any time if you have questions about your manuscript, and you can log into Editorial Manager to check the status of your manuscript (https://service.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/29155/c/10530/supporthub/publishing/kw/status/).

#AU_WATCYC#

To ensure this email reaches the intended recipient, please do not delete the above code

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/watcyc/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.



Comment 3.docx

17K



Muammar Qadafi <qadafim.mq@gmail.com>

Confirming submission to Water Cycle

1 pesan

The Journal <em@editorialmanager.com>
Balas Ke: The Journal <support@elsevier.com>
Kepada: Muammar Qadafi <qadafim.mq@gmail.com>

3 Oktober 2023 pukul 09.43

This is an automated message.

Manuscript Number: WATCYC-D-23-00044R1

Using UV-Vis differential absorbance spectra of tropical peat water DOM fraction to determine trihalomethanes formation potential and its estimated cytotoxicity

Dear Dr Qadafi,

We have received the above referenced manuscript you submitted to Water Cycle.

To track the status of your manuscript, please log in as an author at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/watcyc/>, and navigate to the "Revisions Being Processed" folder.

Thank you for submitting your revision to this journal.

Kind regards,
Water Cycle

More information and support

You will find information relevant for you as an author on Elsevier's Author Hub: <https://www.elsevier.com/authors>

FAQ: How can I reset a forgotten password?

https://service.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/28452/supporthub/publishing/

For further assistance, please visit our customer service site: <https://service.elsevier.com/app/home/supporthub/publishing/>

Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions, and learn more about Editorial Manager via interactive tutorials. You can also talk 24/7 to our customer support team by phone and 24/7 by live chat and email

#AU_WATCYC#

To ensure this email reaches the intended recipient, please do not delete the above code

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/watcyc/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.



Muammar Qadafi <qadafim.mq@gmail.com>

Confirming handling editor for submission to Water Cycle

1 pesan

The Journal <em@editorialmanager.com>

7 Oktober 2023 pukul 14.25

Balas Ke: The Journal <support@elsevier.com>

Kepada: Muammar Qadafi <qadafim.mq@gmail.com>

This is an automated message.

Manuscript Number: WATCYC-D-23-00044R1

Using UV-Vis differential absorbance spectra of tropical peat water DOM fraction to determine trihalomethanes formation potential and its estimated cytotoxicity

Dear Dr Qadafi,

The above referenced manuscript will be handled by Editor-in-Chief Prof. Hongying Hu.

To track the status of your manuscript, please log into Editorial Manager at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/watcyc/>.

Thank you for submitting your work to this journal.

Kind regards,

Water Cycle

More information and support

You will find information relevant for you as an author on Elsevier's Author Hub: <https://www.elsevier.com/authors>

FAQ: How can I reset a forgotten password?

https://service.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/28452/supporthub/publishing/

For further assistance, please visit our customer service site: <https://service.elsevier.com/app/home/supporthub/publishing/>

Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions, and learn more about Editorial Manager via interactive tutorials. You can also talk 24/7 to our customer support team by phone and 24/7 by live chat and email

#AU_WATCYC#

To ensure this email reaches the intended recipient, please do not delete the above code

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/watcyc/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.



Muammar Qadafi <qadafim.mq@gmail.com>

Decision on submission to Water Cycle

1 pesan

Hongying Hu <em@editorialmanager.com>

25 Oktober 2023 pukul 19.37

Balas Ke: Hongying Hu <watercycle@mail.tsinghua.edu.cn>

Kepada: Muammar Qadafi <qadafim.mq@gmail.com>

CC: p.dhamodharan@elsevier.com

Manuscript Number: WATCYC-D-23-00044R1

Using UV-Vis differential absorbance spectra of tropical peat water DOM fraction to determine trihalomethanes formation potential and its estimated cytotoxicity

Dear Dr Qadafi,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to Water Cycle.

I am pleased to inform you that your manuscript has been accepted for publication.

My comments, and any reviewer comments, are below.

Your accepted manuscript will now be transferred to our production department. We will create a proof which you will be asked to check, and you will also be asked to complete a number of online forms required for publication. If we need additional information from you during the production process, we will contact you directly.

We appreciate you submitting your manuscript to Water Cycle and hope you will consider us again for future submissions.

Kind regards,
Hongying Hu
Editor-in-Chief
Water Cycle

Editor and Reviewer comments:

Reviewer #1: The revised manuscript appears to have been carefully executed and it is written up in a clear matter. The authors have addressed carefully point-by-point to the reviewers' comments. This paper is publishable in this revised form. This recommendation reflects a careful reading of the revised manuscript.

Managing Editor:

1. Please check the use of superscript and subscript. For example: line 149, "UV²⁵⁴".
2. Please check the use of unit. There should be a blank between "number" and "unit". For example, line 160, 227nm should be "227 nm".

More information and support

FAQ: When and how will I receive the proofs of my article?

https://service.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/6007/p/10592/supporthub/publishing/related/You will find information relevant for you as an author on Elsevier's Author Hub: <https://www.elsevier.com/authors>

FAQ: How can I reset a forgotten password?

https://service.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/28452/supporthub/publishing/

For further assistance, please visit our customer service site: <https://service.elsevier.com/app/home/supporthub/publishing/>

Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions, and learn more about Editorial Manager via interactive tutorials. You can also talk 24/7 to our customer support team by phone and 24/7 by live chat and email

At Elsevier, we want to help all our authors to stay safe when publishing. Please be aware of fraudulent messages requesting money in return for the publication of your paper. If you are publishing open access with Elsevier, bear in mind that we will never request payment before the paper has been accepted. We have prepared some guidelines (<https://www.elsevier.com/connect/authors-update/seven-top-tips-on-stopping-apc-scams>) that you may find helpful, including a short video on Identifying fake acceptance letters (<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=o5l8thD9XtE>). Please remember that you can contact Elsevier's Researcher Support team (<https://service.elsevier.com/app/home/supporthub/publishing/>) at any time if you have questions about your manuscript, and you can log into Editorial Manager to check the status of your manuscript (https://service.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/29155/c/10530/supporthub/publishing/kw/status/).

#AU_WATCYC#

To ensure this email reaches the intended recipient, please do not delete the above code

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/watcyc/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.